University of Guelph

Department of Philosophy

Winter 2013

**PHIL\*4040-01 Syllabus**

Instructor: Dr. Victoria I. Burke

Course Time: 10:00-11:20 AM TTH

Course Location: MacKinnon 307 (classroom wing)

Office Location: MacKinnon 339 (office wing)

Office Hours: 12:00-12:45 PM TTH

Email: vburke@uoguelph.ca

**Advanced Philosophy of the Environment:**

**Naturalism, Normativity, and the Ethical Treatment of Non-Human Animals**

Theoretical questions about the right way to treat non-human animals are as ancient as philosophy itself. Aristotle, writing in ancient Greece (circa 400-300 BC), is well-known for claiming that non-human animals lack reason or intellect, but that some animals are “intelligent.” Conversely, the Roman Stoics denied that any language, reason, virtue or real emotion could be attributed to non-human animals. *PHIL\*4040 Naturalism, Normativity, and the Ethical Treatment of Non-Human Animals* will examine the ethical treatment of non-human animals through the history of philosophy, history, poetry, applied ethics, feminism, recent European philosophy, liberal political theory, and ethical theory. We will examine the treatment of non-human animals in Aristotle, Descartes, Spinoza, Hume, Kant, Mill, Darwin, Hegel and Heidegger. How should we understand the philosophical category of naturalism? How should we understand the Aristotelian concept of flourishing with respect to non-human animals? How should we understand the idea of “life” itself? We will look at contemporary theoretical issues concerning the moral status of non-human animals, as well as applied ethical treatments of the various areas of practice in which humans use non-human animals. Human beings use non-human animals for food, entertainment, medical experimentation, cosmetic testing, religious ritual, and as assistants for the disabled. We will consider the ethical issues specific to these forms of practice. There are different types of norms, including widely accepted customary norms, explicit standards, and legal norms. Animal “rights” will probably never attain the level of widely accepted customary norms, such as “do not murder, steal, or lie.” It is also widely accepted that the benefits of using animals for, for example, pharmaceutical testing for new cancer or diabetes drugs outweigh any cost to non-human animals. The primary issue we will address then is where, exactly, the line should be drawn in different areas of practice. What types of uses of animals cannot be justified on philosophical grounds, and which uses can be justified? What meaningful ethical distinctions can be drawn between different types of non-human animals? On what grounds? What considerations are salient in making distinctions between different types of animals? Different forms of treatment? Our legal system treats non-human animals as “property,” and we will discuss the conceptual adequacy of framing our understanding in this way. In what different senses can rights be ascribed to non-human animals? How does consideration of the ethical treatment of non-human animals lead to a reconsideration of standard philosophical matters such as autonomy, perception, mind, language, subjectivity, emotion, the first-person perspective, and individuality? We will also examine the meta-ethical category of normativity itself and its relation to naturalism. *PHIL\*4040 Advanced Philosophy of the Environment: Naturalism, Normativity, and the Ethical Treatment of Non-Human Animals* will acquaint students with historical and recent ethical thought on non-human animals with a wide-range of applicability in the biosciences, humanities, and in everyday life.

**Required Texts:**

Beauchamp, T, *et. al.* editors, *The Human Use of Animals: Case Studies in Ethical Choice*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. ISBN 978-0-19-534-019-8

Photocopy packet

**Obtaining Course Texts:** The textbook and the coursepack are available in the university bookstore. [Three of the required readings (articles) on the course syllabus are in the library’s online journal collection available for students to download; also two required readings (articles), as well as the poetry collection, are in the public domain on the WWW.]

**Course Requirements:** Students will be assessed on the basis of two Analysis papers (5-6 pages each), Class Participation and a Final Term Paper (12 pages).

**Distribution:**

Short History Paper (5-6 pages): 25%

Short Applied Ethics Paper (5-6 pages): 25%

Class Participation 15%

Final Term Paper (12 pages): 35%

**Guidelines for submitting written work:** The essays must be submitted on white 8.5 x 11 paper, typed single-sided, and double-spaced. Students must keep a copy of their work for their own files in case the paper should become lost. If the paper becomes lost (by the student or the Instructor), it is the student's responsibility to be able to replace it. Papers may *not* be submitted electronically via e-mail or by fax. Only hard copies are accepted.

**Ecologically friendly writing assignments and Citation Style:** In the interest of maintaining an ecologically sound course, cover sheets are not required on the assignments. Put your name and student number at the top of the first page and start the essay one quarter of the way down the page. Use the MLA, APA, or *Chicago Manual of Style* as a style guide for citations. It is not important which style sheet you use: what is important is that you are consistent and correct. Do not include a separate bibliography page, use footnotes at the bottom of each page. Because this is an advanced course, marks will be subtracted on the writing assignments for sloppy and incorrect citations. I will post a style guide for your convenience on the courselink site.

**Class Participation:** Participation points are awarded for students who actively contribute to class sessions through active engagement with course material, readings and lectures. Disputes, counter-arguments, and in general thorough examination of the subject matter in class discussions, are all welcomed.

**Deadlines:** The deadlines for the two short essay assignments are January 31, 2013, and March 7, 2013. 10% will be subtracted from the student’s grade for every day that the paper is late. The final term paper is due in class on the last day of class, April 4, 2013. Late papers will not be accepted via email, and university regulations regarding late work during the final exam period will be strictly observed.

**Late Papers:** Late papers may be handed in to me directly or to my department mailbox. Essays are not to be submitted to front office staff at the philosophy department. Write the date and time you drop the paper off on the paper. If the date and time you indicate is inconsistent with what I know about the time I pick the paper up, and the dates and times I check the mailbox, the late penalty will be assessed on the basis of the time I pick the paper up. Put the paper directly into the mailbox without disturbing the office staff.

**Email:** Philosophical questions will not be answered on email. Students must avail themselves of class time and office hours in order to have their questions answered. Only short administrative questions will be answered on email. You can expect a response in 48 hours. If the answer to your question can be answered by looking at the courselink site, you will not receive a response.

**Desire2Learn Site:** This class will have a Desire2Learn courselink website, where all handouts (including instructions for the essay assignments) will be posted. Students may access the site through Courselink, and are required to check the site regularly for announcements. Most materials are under the “Content” link.

**Readings, Lectures, Class Meetings:** Students should read the assigned material prior to class. Students’ essays will be assessed on the basis of grammar, style, and the quality of their comprehension and synthesis of the reading material and lectures. Participation points will be awarded on the basis of the extent to which the student actively engages with the subject matter (the readings, lectures, and other students) in class discussions. It is expected that the student will attend the class sessions throughout the semester. It is expected that students will actively engage with other class members in discussing material, and in asking questions and raising objections that have arisen for them in their reading of the material regularly throughout the semester.

**Course Schedule**

**Unit I: History and Theory**

WEEK 1

January 8: Course Introduction: *bios*, *zoe*, *physis*

Required Reading: Agamben, “Introduction” (to *Homo Sacer*), pp. 1-12; Heidegger, “The Animal is Poor in World,” p. 17 (photocopies); Whitman, “Song of Myself,” #32 (in the public domain; copy posted in the poetry collection on Courselink Desire2Learn site)

January 10: Animal Minds, Aristotle, *physis*, and Naturalism

Required Reading: Beauchamp, pp. 3-7; Agamben, Heidegger, Whitman, cont’d.

Recommended: Aristotle, *Physics* B1 (in the public domain on the WWW); Aristotle, *De Anima* Bk II Ch. 2-5, 412b11-418a6, Ch 6, 418a7-418a27, Ch 11-12, 422b18-424b20, Bk III (Ch 3-4, 427a16-430a9, Ch 9-10 432b10-433b31 (the entire *De Anima* is in the library’s electronic collection)

\*Instructions for Short History Paper posted by this date

WEEK 2

January 15: Aristotle, Flourishing and the Capabilities Approach

Required Reading: Nussbaum, “Justice for Non-Human Animals,” 299-320 (in the library’s electronic collection); Waldau, “When Did Animal Protection First Occur?” *Animal Rights: What Everyone Needs to Know*, 76-79 (photocopy)

Recommended: *Nicomachean Ethics*, Books I-II (in the library’s electronic collection)

January 17: Aristotle, Flourishing and the Capabilities Approach

Required Reading: Nussbaum, cont’d.

Recommended: Aristotle, cont’d.

WEEK 3

January 22: Early Modern Conceptions of the Animal: Descartes and Hume

Required Reading: Beauchamp, pp. 8-11; Merchant *The Death of Nature*, “The Mechanical Order,” pp. 192-3, 202-205 (photocopy)

January 24: Early Modern Conceptions of the Animal: Spinoza

Required Reading: Sharp, “Animal Affects: Spinoza and the Frontiers of the Human,” pp. 48-68 (in the public domain on the WWW)

WEEK 4

January 29: Utilitarianism

Required Reading Beauchamp, 9-10: Singer, “All Animals are Equal,” 107-116; Matheny, ‘Utilitarianism and Animals,” pp. 333-341; Cohen, “Do Animals Have Rights?” pp. 348-355 (photocopies)

January 31: Deontology and the Idea of Autonomy

Required Reading: Warren, “Human and Animal Rights Compared,” pp. 356-361; Bataille, “Animality,” pp. 33-36 (photocopies); Thompson, “Enlarging the Sphere of Rights,” pp. 319-328 (in the library’s electronic collection)

\*Short History Paper due (in class)

WEEK 5

February 5: Hegel

Required Reading, De Boer, “The Animal.” 138-42 (photocopy); Morris, “Animals and Humans,” pp. 49-72; Thompson, “Enlarging the Sphere of Rights,” pp. 328-335 (in the library’s electronic collection); Dickenson, “A bird came down the walk,” (in the public domain; copy posted in the poetry collection on courselink Desire2Learn site);

February 7: Darwin

Required Reading: Beauchamp, pp. 11-15; Gould, “Senseless Signs of History,” 27-34. Gould, “So Cleverly Kind An Animal*,”* 260-267 (photocopies)

\*Instructions for 2nd Short Paper posted by this date

**Unit II: Applied Ethics: Animals and Human Practice**

WEEK 6

February 12: Animals for Food: Factory Farming

Required Reading: Beauchamp, “Humane Housing for Hogs,” pp. 41-60; Adams, ‘The Sexual Politics of Meat,” pp. 34-38 (photocopy)

February 14: Animals for Food: Factory Farming

Required Reading: Beauchamp, “Veal Crates and Human Palates,” pp. 61-73; “What is a Chicken Worth?” pp. 74-90

WEEK 7

February 26: Animals for Entertainment: Zoos, Circuses

Required Reading, Beauchamp, “Winky and Wanda at the Detroit Zoo,” pp. 107-119; “Ringling Brothers’ Big Cats,” pp. 120-34; Regan, “Are Zoos Morally Defensible?”; Rilke, “The Panther” (in the public domain; copy posted in the poetry collection on courselink site)

February 28: Animals for Religious Ritual

Required Reading: Beauchamp, “Animal Sacrifice and Religious Ritual: The Santeria Case,” pp. 149-162

WEEK 8

March 5: Animals as Companions

Required Reading: Beauchamp, “Cosmetic Surgery for Dogs,” pp. 135-148; Pangur Bán (from the Old Irish; in the public domain; posted in the poetry collection on the courselink site); Harvey, “Benefits, Welfare, Safeguards, and Relationships,” pp. 166-176; DeGrazia, “Keeping Pets,” pp. 81-87 (photocopies)

March 7: Animals for Cosmetic Testing

Required Reading: Beauchamp, “Can There Be Cruelty Free Cosmetic Testing?” pp. 201-212

\*2nd Short Paper due (in class)

WEEK 9

March 12: Animals for Medical Testing

Required Reading: Beauchamp, ‘Head Injury Experiments on Primates,” pp. 177-186; “Does the Public Have a Right to Know?” pp. 188-199

March 14: Animals for Medical Testing

Required Reading: Beauchamp, “Monkeys Without Mothers,” pp. 217-229; “Experimental Study of Animal Aggression,” pp. 231-243

\*Term Paper Topics posted by this date

WEEK 10

March 19: Endangered Species

Required Reading: Beauchamp, “Bonobos: Humans’ Closest Relatives Face Extinction,” pp. 163-174

March 21: Animals for Science Education

Required Reading: Beauchamp, “Should Frog Dissection Continue?” pp. 263-272; Wright, “Little Frogs Killed On The Highway” (in the public domain; copy posted in the poetry collection on courselink Desire2Learn site)

**Unit III: Animals and Political Theory**

WEEK 11

March 26: Animals and Liberalism

Required Reading: Donaldson and Kymlicka. “Liminal Animal Denizens,” pp. 210-251; Nussbaum, “Toward An Overlapping Consensus?” pp. 388-392 (photocopies)

March 28: Legal Issues

Recommended: Sunstein, “Can Animals Sue?” pp. 251-262 (in the library’s electronic collection)

WEEK 12

April 2: Jacques Derrida and “animality”

Required Reading: Derrida, “The Animal that therefore I am (more to follow),”pp. 1-23; Mallarme, ‘Little Air” (in the public domain; copy posted in the poetry collection on courselink Desire2Learn site)

April 4: Karen Houle, beyond subjectivity, and “becoming plant”

Required Reading: Houle, “Animal, Vegetable, Mineral,” 89-116 (in the public domain on the WWW)

\*Term Paper due in class (12 pages)

**Materials on the Syllabus in the Public Domain on the WWW**

Aristotle, *Physics*

Houle, Karen. “Animal, Vegetable, Mineral: Ethics as Extension or Becoming? The Case of Becoming Plant.” *Journal for Critical Animal Studies*. Volume IX, Issue ½ (2011), 89-116.

Sharp, Hasana. “Animal Affects: Spinoza and the Frontiers of the Human.” *Journal for Critical Animal Studies*. Volume IX, Issue ½ (2011), 48-68.

**Contents of Poetry Collection:** All the poetry that is required reading is in the public domain on the WWW. For your convenience, I have posted each poem on the courselink Desire2Learn site under “Content,” “Poetry Collection.”

Dickenson, Emily, “A bird came down the walk”

Mallarme, Stephan, (excerpt from) “Little Air”

Pangur Bán (Old Irish)

Rilke, Rainier Maria, “The Panther”

Whitman, Walt, (excerpt from) ‘Song of Myself”

Wright, James, “Little Frogs Killed On The Highway”

**Materials on the Syllabus Available For Download From the U of G Library Online Collection**

Aristotle, *De Anima*

Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*

Morris, David. “Animals and Humans, Thinking and Nature.” *Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences*. (2005) 49-72.

Nussbaum, Martha. ”Beyond ‘Compassion and Humanity’: Justice for Non-Human Animals.” *Animal Rights: Current Debates and New Directions*. Ed. Martha C. Nussbaum and Cass Sunstein. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004), 299-320. ISBN-13: 978-19-530510-4; 337 pp.

Sunstein, Cass. “Can Animals Sue?” *Animal Rights: Current Debates and New Directions*. Ed. Martha C. Nussbaum and Cass Sunstein. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004), 251-262. ISBN-13: 978-19-530510-4; 337 pp.

Thompson, Michael J. “Enlarging the Sphere of Recognition: A Hegelian Approach to Animal Rights.” *Journal of Value Inquiry*. (2011) 45:319-335.

**Bibliography for Photocopy Packet**

Adams, Carol. *The Sexual Politics of Meat*. (New York: Continuum Publishing Company, 1990),34-38. ISBN 0--8264-0455-3; 256 pp.

Agamben, Giorgio. *Homo Sacer: Sovereign Power and Bare Life*. Trans. Daniel Heller-Roazen. (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1998), 1-12. ISBN: 0-8047-3218-3; 199 pp.

Bataille, Georges. “Animality.” *Animal Philosophy: Ethics and Identity*. Ed M. Calarco and P. Atterton. (London, UK: Continuum, 2004), 33-36. ISBN-10: 0-8264-6413-0; 220 pp.

Cohen, Carl. “Do Animals Have Rights?” *Disputed Moral Issues: A Reader*. Ed. Mark Timmons. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 348-355. ISBN: 978-0-19-538872-5; 679 pp.

De Boer, Karin. “The Animal.” *On Hegel: The Sway of the Negative*. (Houndsmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire, UK: Palgrave MacMillan, 2010), 138-42.ISBN13-978-0-230-24754-3; 265 pp.

DeGrazia, David. “Keeping Pets.” *Animal Rights: A Very Short Introduction*. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), 81-87.ISBN 978-0-19-285360—8; 130 pp.

Derrida, Jacques. “The Animal That Therefore I Am (More To Follow).” *The Animal That Therefore I Am*. Trans. David Wills. (New York: Fordham University Press, 2008), 1-23. ISBN-13: 978-0-8232-2790-7; 176 pp.

Donaldson, Sue, and Will Kymlicka. “Liminal Animal Denizens.” *Zoopolis: A Political Theory of Animal Rights*. (Oxford: Oxford University Press,2011), 210-251. ISBN 978-0-19-959966-0; 329 pp.

Gould, Stephen Jay. “Senseless Signs of History.” *The Panda’s Thumb: More Reflections on Natural History*.(New York: W.W. Norton and Company, 1980), 27-34. ISBN 0-393-30023-4; 343 pp.

Gould, Stephen Jay. “So Cleverly Kind An Animal*.” Ever Since Darwin: Reflections on Natural History*. New York: W.W. Norton and Company, 1973), 260-267. ISBN 0-393-00917-3; 283 pp.

Harvey, Jean. “Companion and Assistance Animals: Benefits, Welfare Safeguards, and Relationships.” *International Journal of Applied Philosophy*. 22 (2), 161-176.

Heidegger, Martin. “The Animal is Poor in World.” *Animal Philosophy: Ethics and Identity*. Ed M. Calarco and P. Atterton. (London, UK: Continuum, 2004), 17. ISBN-10: 0-8264-6413-0; 220 pp.

Matheny, Gaverick. “Utilitarianism and Animals.” *Disputed Moral Issues: A Reader*. Ed. Mark Timmons. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 333-341. ISBN: 978-0-19-538872-5; 679 pp.

Merchant, Carolyn. “The Mechanical Order.” *The Death of Nature: Women, Ecology and the Scientific Revolution*. (San Francisco: Harper & Row Publishers, 1980), 192-3; 202-205. ISBN 0-06-250572—6; 348 pp.

Nussbaum, Martha.” Toward An Overlapping Consensus?” *Frontiers of Justice: Disability, Nationality, and Species Membership*. Cambridge, MA: The Bellknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2006), 388-392. ISBN: 0-674-01917—2; 487 pp.

Singer, Peter. “All Animals Are Equal.” *Ethics in Practice.* Ed. Hugh Lafollette. (Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2002), 107-116. ISBN 0-631-2834-9; 679 pp.

Regan, Tom. “Are Zoos Morally Defensible?” *Disputed Moral Issues: A Reader*. Ed. Mark Timmons. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 342-347. ISBN: 978-0-19-538872-5; 679 pp.

Warren, Mary Ann. “Human and Animal Rights Compared.” *Disputed Moral Issues: A Reader*. Ed. Mark Timmons. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 356-361. ISBN: 978-0-19-538872-5; 679 pp.

Waldau, Paul. *Animal Rights: What Everyone Needs to Know*. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 76-79. ISBN 978-0-19-973996-7; 236 pp.

**Materials On Reserve At The U of G McLaughlin Library (2 hour loan period)**

Beauchamp, *et. al.* *The Human Use of Animals: Case Studies in Ethical Choice*

Nussbaum, Martha. *Frontiers of Justice: Disability, Nationality, Species Membership*

1 copy of the photocopy packet

**Of Possible Interest (recommended, but not on the syllabus)**

Aristotle, *History of Animals* [in the public domain on the WWW]

Aristotle, *Parts of Animals* [in the public domain on the WWW]

Heidegger, Martin. “On the Essence and Concept of *Physis i*n Aristotle’s *Physics* B, 1” [“Vom Wesen und Begriff der *Physis* im Aristoteles *Physik* B, 1]” (1939). Trans Thomas Sheehan. *Pathmarks*. Ed. William McNeill. (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1998), 183-230.

Nussbaum, Martha. *Frontiers of Justice: Disability, Nationality, Species Membership*, 155-173.

**E-mail Communication**

As per University regulations, all students are required to check their **uoguelph.ca** e-mail account regularly: e-mail is the official route of communication between the university and its students.

**When You Cannot Meet a Course Requirement**

When you find yourself unable to meet an in-course requirement because of illness or compassionate reasons, please advise the course instructor (or designated person, such as a teaching assistant) in writing, with your name, ID#, and e-mail contact. See the Undergraduate Calendar for information on regulations and procedures for Academic Consideration:

http://www.uoguelph.ca/registrar/calendars/undergraduate/current/c08/c08-ac.shtml

**Drop Date**

The last date to drop one-semester **Winter 2013** courses, without academic penalty, is **Friday, March 8, 2013.** For regulations and procedures for Dropping Courses, see the Undergraduate Calendar: http://www.uoguelph.ca/registrar/calendars/undergraduate/current/c08/c08-drop.shtml

**Copies of out-of-class assignments**

Keep paper and/or other reliable back-up copies of all out-of-class assignments: you may be asked to resubmit work at any time.

**Student Rights and Responsibilities**

Each student at the University of Guelph has rights which carry commensurate responsibilities which, broadly, being a civil and respectful member of the University community. The Rights and Responsibilities are detailed in the Undergraduate Calendar: http://www.uoguelph.ca/registrar/calendars/undergraduate/current/c14/c14-strightsrespon.shtml

**Academic Misconduct**

The University of Guelph is committed to upholding the highest standards of academic integrity and enjoins all members of the University community – faculty, staff, and students – to be aware of what constitutes academic misconduct and to do as much as possible to prevent academic offences from occurring. The Academic Misconduct Policy is detailed in the Undergraduate Calendar:

http://www.uoguelph.ca/registrar/calendars/undergraduate/current/c08/c08-amisconduct.shtml

**Recording of Materials**

Presentations which are made in relation to course work—including lectures—cannot be recorded in any electronic media without the permission of the presenter, whether the instructor, a classmate or guest lecturer.

**Resources**

The Undergraduate Calendar is the source of information about the University of Guelph’s procedures, policies and regulations which apply to undergraduate programs. It can be found at:

http://www.uoguelph.ca/registrar/calendars/undergraduate/current/

If you find yourself in difficulty, contact the undergraduate advisor in your program, or the BA Counseling Office: http://www.uoguelph.ca/baco/contact.sht